

Tractate Brachos

[In our last lesson, please review, we left off with the understanding that the time of a poor person and the time of a Kohen are not the same times.] **Which one of these two is the later [time]? It is logical that the poor person is later** [we can assume that the later time is that of the poor person]. **Because if you say that the poor person is the earlier** [time, it would mean that] **R' Chanina is the same** [time as R' Eliezer]. [Let us put all our rationals from the past lessons into perspective:]

Earliest time to say the evening Shema

- A. Meir: Time of Shabbat meal
- B. Sages: Kohanim eat Terumah (three stars appear)
- C. Baraita: Poor man eats his bread

- I. It is assumed that $A=C$ this would mean...
- II. That if $B=C$ then B also = A because of the assumption (I)

Present lesson: Which is the earlier time: poor man or Kohen?

- D. Chanina: Poor man eats his bread
- E. Meir: Kohen immerses in mikvah
- F. Yehoshua: Kohen eats his terumah (three stars appear)
- G. Eliezer: Shabbat is sanctified (bein hashemashos)

- I. If you say D is earlier, then we must say that $D=G$, before the three stars
- II. Should it not be that D is the later time (even later than A)?

Rather, is it not you learn from this [the time] **of a poor person is later. Learn from this.** [Now let us go back to R' Yehudah and R' Meir's dispute] **The Master said: R' Yehudah said to R' Meir** [how can you say that the time of the Kohen's immersion is the time one may already say the evening Shema] **When Kohanim immerse themselves** [it is] **while it is still day** [and people do not yet go to sleep, how can you thus recite the evening Shema?] **R' Yehuda spoke well to R' Meir** [his comment is justified]. **This is what R' Meir** [would] **say to** [R' Yehudah in answer to his remark]: **Do you think that I am referring to your bein hashemashos** [do you think that I am referring to your understanding of when bein hashemashos is?] **I am referring to bein hashemashos as explained by R' Yose, for R' Yose said: bein hashemashos is like the blink of an eye, this enters, and this departs, and it is impossible to determine it** [the exact moment].

From this we know that R' Meir holds as R' Yose, and according to R' Yose the Kohanim immerse into the mikvah moments before the appearance of the three stars, and one may assume that this is late enough to go to sleep, therefore, one may also recite the evening Shema at this time. But now we have run into a glitch (if you have not spotted it yourself, the Gamorah will elaborate) **R' Meir contradicts R' Meir** [R' Meir made two statements which are opposed: 1. When people eat of their Shabbat meal, 2. When the Kohen immerses (bein hashemashos) we have already determined that these two times cannot be identical]. **Two** [different] **Tannaim** [authors] **as to R' Meir** [they may not be the same R' Meir. Let us now summarize where we stand.

Our Gamorah has mentioned 3 baraitas. First it wishes to relate that the time of a poor man, and the time of the Kohanim eating their terumah are the same time, but this was proved wrong. The poor man eats later.

- I. Eliezer: From the time Shabbat is sanctified (bein hashemashos)
- II. Meir: From the time the Kohanim enter the mikvah (before 3 stars)
- III. Yehoshuah: When the Kohanim may eat of the terumah (after 3 stars)

IV. Chanina: *From the time a poor person enters to eat his bread (after 3 stars)*

R' Eliezer contradicts R' Eliezer [The Gamorah also points out the same issue with R' Eliezer, because he states in our Mishnah: "When the Kohanim are permitted to eat of their terumah (appearance of 3 stars)", but in the baraita he states: "When the Shabbat becomes sanctified (before 3 stars)."] **Two different Tannaim as to R' Eliezer** [The Gamorah also informs us that the Mishnah and the baraita are two different R' Eliezers].