

## Tractate Brachos

Read through the last lesson's Gamorah, so that you will be up to date. Then read through the Gamorah below. Ponder it for a few seconds, and see how you understand it. Then move on to this lesson and we will learn it.

**In the west they did not hear this of Rabbah bar Rav Shila, and they asked this question: this, “and when the sun comes...”, does it mean the setting of the sun? And what does “vetaher” [mean]? [The meaning is] The person makes himself tahor [when he brings his offering]. Also, they resolved that from a baraita: Since it states in a baraita: A sign for the matter is the appearance of the stars, you learn from this that [this verse] means the setting of the sun. And what does “vetaher” [mean]? The passing of the day. The master said: From the time that Kohanim enter to eat their Terumah. They contrasted this with: From when may we recite the Shema in the evenings? From when a poor person enters to eat his bread with salt until the time he gets up to take leave from his meal. The end certainly disputes our Mishnah. Shall we say that the beginning disputes our Mishnah?**

**No! A poor person and a Kohen are the same time. They contrasted this with: From when may we begin reciting the Shema in the evening? From the time that poor people enter to eat their bread on Shabbat eves. The words of R' Meir. But the Sages say, From the time that Kohanim are entitled to eat their Terumah, the sign for this is the appearance of the stars. And even though there is no proof to this matter, there is an indication of this matter. For it states: So we did the work, with half of them grasping the spears, from the rising of dawn until the appearance of the stars. And it states, and the night was for watch and the day for work. What is “and it states”? And if you will say that as soon as the sun sets it is night, but they work after dark, and they began early, come learn: “And the night was for us a watch and the day for work.” It was assumed that a poor person and people are the same time. Now, if you say that a poor person and a Kohen are the same time, the opinion of the Sages is the same as R' Meir. Rather, learn from this a poor person is a time to itself a Kohen is a time to itself.**

**No! A poor person and a Kohen are the same time, whereas a poor person and people are not the same time. And a poor person and a Kohen are the same time? But they contrasted this with: From when may one begin to recite the Shema in the evenings? From the time the day becomes sanctified on Shabbat eves. The words of R' Eliezer. R' Yehoshua says: From the time Kohanim become tahor to eat their Terumah. R' Meir said: From the time Kohanim immerse themselves to eat their Terumah. R' Yehudah said to R' Meir: But Kohanim immerse themselves while it is still day. R' Chanina said: From the time a poor person enters to eat his bread with salt. R' Acha and some say R' Acha said: From the time most people enter to recline. Now, if you say a poor person and a Kohen are the same time, R' Chanina is the same as R' Yehoshua. Rather, is it not that you learn from this the time to a poor person is a time to itself and the time to a Kohen is a time to itself. Learn from this.**

### Explanation of the Gamorah:

**In the west** [this generally means, in the land of Israel] **they did not hear this of Rabbah bar Rav Shila** [that he said the baraita should have used the command form of the word “passed”, which is “veyitaher”], **and they asked this question: this, “and when the sun comes...”, does it mean the setting of the sun? And what does “vetaher” [mean]? [The meaning is] The person makes himself tahor** [when he brings his offering. Thus, the following morning. They asked the same question, being that they did not receive the explanation of Rabbah bar Rav Shila]. **Subsequently, they resolved that from a baraita; Since it states in a baraita** [the baraita to which they will refer, will be stated in the following section of the Gamorah]; **A sign for the matter** [the matter of when a Kohen may eat of the Terumah] **is the appearance of the stars, you learn from this that** [the verse] **means the setting of the sun. And what does “vetaher” [mean]? The passing of the day** [We now have two sources which hold that the Gamorah's proof, the baraita, does in fact mean, the night, and not the morning. We can thus follow this line of

reasoning in determining the Mishnah further].

[Now the Gamorah will review the Tanna's ruling:] **The master said** [that the time one may begin to recite the evening Shema is] **from the time that Kohanim enter to eat their Terumah. They contrasted this with a baraita** [this brings up a conflict with a baraita]. **From when may we recite the Shema in the evenings? From when a poor person enters to eat his bread with salt, until the time he gets up to take leave from his meal** [The Gamorah now brings forth another baraita, which may prove to conflict with our Tanna's ruling. Rashi points out here that the writer of this baraita uses the verse, "when you lie down..." to refer to the time that people begin going to sleep. Now the Gamorah will focus on this new baraita.] **The end of** [this baraita: "...until the time he gets up to take leave of his meal"] **certainly disputes our Mishnah** [because this time is earlier than the earliest 'until' time of our Mishnah, which would be, "until the end of the first watch'.] **Shall we say that the beginning** [the part of our baraita which states, from when a poor person enters to eat...] [also] **disputes our Mishnah?** [If we say that the times are different... our Mishnah: from when a Kohen who is tamei may eat of the Terumah, and the beginning of the baraita... a poor person enters, then there is a dispute, but if they are not different, then they are the same.]

[The Gamorah is concerned because it assumes that a poor person eats early, before nightfall. He cannot afford a candle by which to eat his meal. He eats while there is still daylight (Rashi). This view would cause our baraita to conflict with our Mishnah. However, the baraita uses the term "enters" to eat, this seems to imply that they enter early, but eat later. To this, Tosafos presents a problem. If the time for reciting the Shema starts when the poor person enters to eat, when may they, in particular, recite the Shema, because we all know that it is forbidden to say the evening prayers after dinner. Therefore, the correct time for reciting the Shema must be a few moments before the poor man eats. During the time that it takes to prepare his meal. This is the reason why the verse says "enter to eat" in place of simply stating "when he eats" (Tosafos) The Gamorah tries to resolve:] **No. A poor person and a Kohen are the same time** [the Gamorah maintains that the poor person goes in to eat at night, the same time as when a Kohen may eat of the Terumah and it will give proof.] **They contrasted this with** [a baraita]: **From when may we begin reciting the Shema in the evenings? From the time that people enter to eat their bread on Shabbat eves** [On Shabbat evening (Friday night) we usually begin the meal early and everything has been prepared early as well (Rashi). The time for eating on Shabbat eve is earlier than the time people eat on a regular weekday.] **These are the words of R' Meir. But the Sages say: From the time that Kohanim are entitled to eat their Terumah. The sign for this is the appearance of the stars** [when the stars are out, one may be sure that the time is right. R' Meir holds then, that we may say the Shema from the time that people who hold the Shabbat meal do so. Earlier than night fall, but the Sages maintain with nightfall.] **And even though there is no proof to this matter** [that the day actually ends when the stars appear] **there is an indication of this matter. For it states** [in Nehemiah 4:15]: **So we did the work, with half of them grasping the spears, from the rising of dawn until the appearance of the stars. And it states further: And the night was for us and the day for work** [this verse from Nehemiah is brought forth in order to give proof that the term "appearance of the stars" means night, however, before going further, the Gamorah asks...] **What is "and it states"?** [Why does the Gamorah have to add on the second part (final part) of the verse by repeating "and it states further"? Is the first part of the verse not enough evidence? The Gamorah will now show us why the second verse is needed].

[The second statement is needed to rebut the following point of view...] **And if you will say that as soon as the sun sets it is night, but they** [continue to] **work after dark and began** [again] **early** [in the morning before sunrise. Therefore, the length of their workday does not prove when the day actually begins and when it ends, then...] **come learn** [from the following verse which states:] **And the night was for us a watch and the day for work** [the day was for working, and the night for watching. Here you have your proof. The Gamorah will now try to show that the time of a poor person is not identical to the time of the Kohen who eats his Terumah]. **It was assumed that a poor person and people are the same time** [the time that a poor person enters, and the time that people hold their Shabbat meal, are the same times. Also, both rely on a preparation period before the meal]. **Now, if you say that a poor person and a Kohen are the same time, then** [you hold that] **the** [opinion] **of the Sages** [in our baraita] **is the same** [time] **as** [the opinion stated by] **R' Meir** [If you say that the times of a poor person and a Kohen are the same, then you

are also saying that R' Meir (who holds that one may recite the Shema from when the people eat their Shabbat bread) and the Sages (who hold by the stars at night) are the same time, and this cannot be.]

[We cannot say that they are the same times. Let us review. If we hold by the fact that the time of a poor person, and those people who hold Shabbat meal are the same time, then we are saying that we hold partially as R' Meir. His view is that we may say the Shema based on the baraita of the people who enter for their Shabbat meal. Why can this not be? Because then we would also be holding that a poor person (who has the same times as the people of Shabbat) is the same as the Kohanim (we must hold by the Kohanim time, because this is our Mishnah's ruling. However, what we are trying to analyse is, what is the exact time of this event), and we have already seen in the Gamorah, that R' Meir's view is placed as an opposing view to the Sages, who hold by the stars. Thus we cannot say that a poor person holds the same time as the Kohanim time for eating his Terumah. Contemplate this argument for a while, and see if you comprehend it fully. If you have to, draw a chart.]

Mishnah: When the Kohanim enter to eat their Terumah  
Baraita 1: When a poor man enters to eat of his meal  
Baraita 2: R' Meir: When people enter to eat on Shabbat eve  
Sages: When Kohanim are entitled to eat the Terumah. The stars.

Presently we hold: Baraita 1 is the same as the Shabbat meal - this would make Baraita 1's time the same as R' Meir's time, and Baraita 2 shows R' Meir's view as being opposed to the Sages' view. So we cannot hold such.

**Rather, learn from this, a poor person is a time to itself, a Kohen is a time to itself.** [The Gamorah wishes to use the above as proof that a poor person's time is not the same as the view of the Sages, which is night fall.]

**No!** [the time for] **a poor person and [the time for] a Kohen are not the same time, whereas [the time for] a poor person and [the time for] people [who hold Shabbat] are not the same time.** [The Gamorah rejects the first view, and says that the discrepancy lies not between the poor man and the Kohen, they are the same time, what we are learning wrong is that the time for a poor person and the time for a person who holds a Shabbat meal are not the same time]. **And [is it true that the time for] a poor person and [the time for] a Kohen are not the same time? But they can be contrasted with [a new baraita]: From when may one begin to recite the Shema in the evenings? From the time the day becomes sanctified on Shabbat eves [these are] the words of R' Eliezer [This time falls in bein hashemashos, it is the twilight time which comes just before nightfall. Of this exact time, we are all uncertain. Shabbat truly starts within that time period, and the exact moment we cannot pinpoint - It is like a blacksmith who is about to strike his anvil, Shabbat starts somewhere in between when his hammer is raised, and when his hammer strikes the anvil. For this reason, we must start Shabbat a bit before nightfall, so that we are already acting within the halachos of Shabbat the exact time when it truly starts.]**

[There are many discussions within the Gamorah about the exact moment, and we will come across a few of these within this tractate]. **R' Yehoshua says: From the time Kohanim become tahor to eat their Terumah [nightfall - when the stars appear] R' Meir said: From the time Kohanim immerse themselves to eat their Terumah [the same night]. R' Yehudah said to R' Meir: But Kohanim immerse themselves while it is still day [R' Yehudah holds that the twilight, bein hashemashos, is very quick, he states that it lasts only the amount of time that it takes to walk a mil (form of measurement), and therefore, the Kohen must immerse themselves while it is still day light, and at this time people do not accustom themselves to go to sleep - and how can one fulfill his obligation to recite the evening Shema at that time?] R' Chanina said: From the time a poor person enters to eat his bread with salt. R' Acha, and some say, R' Acha said: From the time most people enter to recline [this is a term for a proper meal - and this is a later time than any other times mentioned before, because the reclining meal represents that people are already at their table enjoying - the meal stands prepared. The Gamorah will now try and conclude.]**

**Rather, it is not [that] you learn from this the time [as mentioned in regards to] a poor person is a time**

**to itself and the time to a Kohen is a time to itself. Learn from this** [they are surely different times].

The Gamorah has now established that they are two different times. It will next go back and try to decide which time is later, the poor person or the Kohanim.

Now try and read the Gamorah again in its entirety, and see how it strikes you.